

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

1. The proposed program will be implemented across Pakistan and will finance investments for strengthening institutional and organizational capacity for social protection under unconditional cash transfer (UCT) and conditional cash transfer (CCT), (ii) expanding CCT for primary education, and (iii) evaluating the design and implementation of pilot CCT for nutrition. The program will be financed under the results-based lending (RBL) modality which aims to increase accountability and incentives for delivering and sustaining results, improve the effectiveness and efficiency of government-owned sector programs, promote institutional development, and enhance development effectiveness.

2. ADB will engage consultants on an individual basis, following the Asian Development Bank (ADB) Procurement Policy (2017, as amended from time to time) and its associated staff instructions. The transaction technical assistance (TRTA) will finance approximately 26 person-months of international consultant inputs and 26 person-months of national consultant inputs. These will both be input-based contracts or, where appropriate, output-based or lumpsum contracts. The TRTA consultants task involves: (i) sector and subsector analysis; (ii) technical assessment and aspects; (iii) fiduciary system assessment; (iv) program financial and economic analysis; (v) program safeguard assessment; (vi) social, poverty, and gender assessment; (vii) program implementation arrangements; (viii) monitoring and evaluation system assessment; (ix) integrated risk assessment; and (x) development of a program action plan (PAP). The summary of TRTA consulting requirements is shown in Table 1.

Table 1: Summary of Consulting Services Requirement

Positions	Person-Months Required
International	
1. Social Protection and Conditional Cash Transfer Specialist and Team Leader	5
2. Financial Management and Risk Specialist	3
3. Education Specialist	3
4. Health & Nutrition Specialist	3
5. Social Development and Gender Specialist	3
6. Project Implementation and System Specialist	3
7. Monitoring and Evaluation (M & E) Specialist	3
8. Targeting Specialist	3
Total	26
National	
1. Social Protection and Cash Transfer Specialist	4
2. Financial Management and Risk Specialist	4
3. Capacity Development Specialist	3
4. Training Facilitator	3
5. Social Sector Economist	4
6. Social Development and Gender Specialist	4
7. Monitoring & Evaluation Specialist	4
Total	26

Source: Asian Development Bank

3. **Sector and Subsector Analysis.** This task involves a sector analysis with the review of existing national sector strategies, programs, and plans for improving social protection and poverty alleviation. The consultants will: (i) identify issues and challenges that are impeding the Benazir Income Support Program (BISP), other sector institutions and their strengths and weakness; (ii) assess if *Ehsaas*, the broader sector strategy, provides sufficient guidance for the proposed RBL program; (iii) review the socioeconomic development plans, along with the

allocated budgets for BISP; (iv) conduct a stakeholder analysis to identify key stakeholders, including BISP Beneficiary Communities (BBC), and their support for the program; (v) review and assess enabling policies for sustainability of social protection services sustainability including, disaster risk management, and climate change strategy and action plans.

4. **Technical Assessment.** This will include assessment of program soundness, results and links with disbursements, including expenditures and financing framework, engineering (technology, equipment, and facilities) aspects vis-à-vis local capacities and operation and maintenance. The consultants will assess whether the program: (i) underpinned by *Vision 2025*, which defines sector objectives; (ii) is strategically relevant and justified; (iii) adequate with respect to its effectiveness, efficiency and economy, and sustainability in addressing the development challenges at hand, including program financial and economic analysis; and (iv) has adequate implementation arrangements, where the consultants will assess the roles, incentives, capacities, resources, practice, and performance of the sector institutions, and other interagency relationships.

5. Current financing mechanisms of the national program for capital expenditures and operation and maintenance will be reviewed. Accordingly, the design and monitoring framework of the proposed RBL will be reviewed to determine results and its links with disbursements. The results under RBL may include intermittent results (process indicator) related with institutional and program system performance. Key stakeholders (national and provincial Governments, development partner, and program beneficiaries and BBCs where active/organized) will be consulted in more depth to understand their interests, and perception of problems and solutions to inform subproject design parameters, institutional and capacity bottlenecks, and major issues faced by provincial Governments and BBCs for sustaining the benefits.

6. **Fiduciary Systems Assessment (Financial Management, Procurement and Anti-Corruption).** As an integral part of project preparation for RBL programs, ADB requires that a comprehensive fiduciary assessment is completed. The assessment will be prepared in accordance with ADB's Staff Guidance for Piloting Results-Based Lending for Programs (November 2013) and presented in accordance with the relevant templates. The consultants will assess the program's fiduciary systems' ability to manage fiduciary risks and provide reasonable assurance for the appropriate use of program funds. The overall output will be a fiduciary systems assessment which assesses financial management, corruption risks and recommend mitigating measures, including capacity development activities. This assessment will include financial management assessment, anticorruption assessment, and procurement risk assessment.

7. **Program Safeguard System Assessment.** The TRTA will determine the significance of potential impacts of the program with respect to environment, involuntary resettlement, and indigenous peoples and identify the level of assessment and resources required to address safeguard issues. The scope of the proposed RBL will include subprojects that are classified C. The environment category and climate risk classification of the program will be confirmed. A program safeguard assessment for environment and social safeguard will be prepared. The assessment of program safeguard will include document review complemented by field visits for complete assessment of the adequacy of the current program's safeguard system pertinent to the program to ensure that measures for avoiding or mitigation of the adverse impacts have been assessed. The TRTA will identify and highlight the program's inconsistency with the applicable SPS policy principles (if any) and the significance of these gaps. Safeguard related program actions will be prepared to address identified gaps in program safeguard system and will be included in the overall PAP.

8. **Social, poverty and gender assessment.** The TRTA will conduct a poverty, social, and gender assessment of the program beneficiaries, as well as relevant government strategies such as *Ehsaas*. The TRTA will support the conduct of the socio-economic survey of a sample of beneficiaries and BBCs (where active/organized), including the collection of baseline information (such as poverty incidence, occupations and income, incidence of wasting and stunting, and so on). The resulting Poverty, Social, and Gender Assessment Report will contain quantitative and qualitative information which will be the basis for setting targets in the design and monitoring framework and disbursement-linked indicators (DLI).

9. **Program implementation arrangements.** The TRTA will review and assess the institutional capacity of the executing agency (EA), implementing agency (IA), implementing partners (IP) covering the roles, incentives, capacities, resources, practice, performance and interagency relationships and prepare implementation arrangements and capacity development programs. The TRTA will also identify policy, institutional, and human resource bottlenecks that constrain effective subproject implementation with respect to service delivery and quality of services. The TRTA will assess: (i) whether (a) the IA and IPs identified are appropriate, (b) relevant agencies are involved in the program, and (c) their roles and responsibilities are clearly defined; (ii) whether there are adequate and appropriate incentives for the EA, IA and IPs to perform and collaborate for the success of the program; (iii) the capacity of the EA, IA, IP to implement the program; (iv) the staffing levels of IA and IPs, availability of external support, and availability and timeliness of financial resources; (v) whether the agencies have satisfactory practices and performance; (vi) whether the reporting and oversight mechanism are clear, and whether the arrangements encourage inter-agency cooperation, local administration structures, and relationships among key institutions—in particular, EA, IA, and IP and BBCs. It will also assess inter linkages, information flow mechanisms and key decision-making points; prepare a gap analysis report with recommendations on policy and institutional reforms that may be required; and prepare the overall implementation arrangements, including resource allocation, for the program covering all various plans prepared.

10. **Monitoring and evaluation system assessment.** The TRTA will verify the problem analysis, validate the problem tree, derive a solution tree, refine the design and monitoring framework, and finalize the DLIs and its verification protocols in consultation with the government, EA, IA, and IPs. The framework will aim to facilitate (i) conceptualization of the proposed program design; (ii) monitoring of the program planning and implementation; (iii) disbursement of program funds; and (iv) evaluation of program benefits and impacts, emphasizing enhanced participation of beneficiaries and stakeholders. The TRTA will support the preparation of the program monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system that monitors and reports on the achievements of DLIs and program results. The DLI protocols will be an integral part of the M&E arrangements. The M&E systems may include multifaceted approaches, such as information systems and beneficiary group feedback. The M&E system will promote learning and sound decision making; enable transparent and reliable monitoring of program performance and support timely remedies when problems occur.

11. On the institutional dimension, the TRTA will assess whether the program's monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system can generate reliable, timely, and adequate information on results. It will assess: (i) the institutional arrangements for M&E; (ii) M&E capacity, including staffing and other resources; (iii) M&E experience in case of ongoing programs; and (iv) capacity development needs. On the operational side, the TRTA will support review: (i) M&E plans; (ii) data availability and quality; (iii) reporting arrangements; and (iv) information sharing and disclosure

arrangements. The status of a program's DLIs will be disclosed in a timely manner and made accessible to stakeholders to allow them to monitor and provide feedback.

12. **Integrated risk assessment.** The TRTA will conduct an integrated risk assessment to identify risks that may undermine achievements of the RBL program outcome. The risk management and capacity development measures will be prepared in the form of a comprehensive risk management plan. Early inputs from the assessments may lead to modifications of the program's scope to ensure that identified risks can be adequately managed. The integrated risk assessment will be conducted in consultation with the government, EA, and IA. During implementation, the EA monitors the evolution of risks, identifies the emergence of new risks, assesses progress in implementing risk management measures, and adjusts and update the risk assessment as needed.

13. **Development of a Program Action Plan.** The TRTA will develop and facilitate an agreement with the government, EA, IA, and IPs on the PAP which will be executed and monitored during the program implementation. The PAP will include actions to improve the program's design and implementation, support the achievements of results including disbursement linked indicators, strengthen the program's systems and institutions, increase institutions' capacity, and mitigate risks. No PAP will be necessary if the assessment concludes that the program systems are adequate for achieving the results and managing the risks. All actions in PAP must have strong government ownership.

A. International Consultants

1. **Social Protection and Conditional Cash Transfer Specialist and Team Leader** (5 person-months). The social protection and conditional cash transfer specialist/Team Leader shall have a master's degree in Economics, Social Work, Public Administration, or other relevant discipline, with more than 10 years of experience in designing, implementing, and/or evaluating social protection policies and programs. Prior experience working on social assistance with ADB or other development partner is an advantage. He/she shall be responsible for developing a loan program suitable for ADB financing and shall: review the social protection policies and strategies of government and the BISP's implementation progress; work with the ADB project team, and coordinate the tasks of other consultants to guide overall project design and implementation arrangements; prepare technical reports and linked documents, and coordinate other due diligence for processing; and present findings of review and technical studies to various stakeholders.

2. **Financial Management and Risk Specialist** (3 person-months). The financial management and risk specialist shall have a degree in finance and management with at least 10 years of experience in financial management, project implementation of development projects. He / She shall (i) conduct financial management assessment of the executing agency, in accordance with ADB guidelines; (iii) review risks and recommend measures to help safeguard risks; (iv) prepare financial and funds flow arrangements for the program; (vi) prepare financing plan and describe the flow of funds and disbursement procedures

3. **Education Specialist** (3 person-months) **and Health and Nutrition Specialist** (3 person-months). The specialists shall have postgraduate degrees in the field of education / health, with at least 10 years of experience in public health, nutrition and primary education. They will review the state of primary education and provision of public health services and nutrition in Pakistan and assess requirements for a conditional cash transfer program, define protocols and conditions required for beneficiaries to achieve objectives. They shall undertake, on a sampling basis, a supply side assessment of education and health services and develop a procedure for the replication of such assessments.

4. **Social Development and Gender Specialist** (3 person-months) The social development and gender specialist will have a degree in gender, anthropology, international development, social development, sociology, or related fields with (post graduate for the international consultant) at least 10 years of relevant professional experience in social development, social protection, or gender and development. Familiarity with ADB policies on social safeguards and gender development is required. Working experience in Pakistan is highly preferred. The expert shall be responsible for: (i) preparing and finalizing the poverty, social and gender assessments, reports and plans for the proposed program in accordance with ADB's Guidelines; conduct field surveys and focus group discussions to inform the assessments; provide inputs to the project team on social dimension and safeguard.

5. **Project Implementation and System Specialist** (3 person-months). The project implementation and system specialist shall have a degree in finance and management with at least 10 years of experience in project financial management, project implementation and operations. The specialist must be familiar with procurement guidelines, risk management and related procedures of ADB and the government. The specialist will review governance, integrity and risks, capacity and coordinate closely with the team leader, financial management and capacity building consultants in developing a risk profile and recommending mitigation measures. He / she shall review available project implementation documents of BISP and similar programs

and extract relevant and useful learning, review the procurement and fiduciary capacity. He / she shall develop a risk management action plan for managing risks and prepare the Program Implementation Document (PID).

6. **Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist** (3 person-months). The monitoring and evaluation specialist shall have post graduate degree in economics or statistics, with 10 years working experience in monitoring and evaluation and undertaking impact evaluation studies and surveys using randomized control trials or semi-experimental methods. Familiarity with statistical analysis software programs is preferred for both. He / She shall be responsible for the following: (i) prepare options for improving the social registry and its interoperability with BISP targeting and ID system; (ii) develop and recommend a monitoring and evaluation framework for the project, including reporting templates; (iii) define project baseline in support of the M & E framework; (iv) review DLIs and define indicators, means of verification and timing with disbursements.

7. **Targeting Specialist** (3 person-months). The targeting specialist will have a master's degree in statistics, economics, social welfare, or related field with at least 10 years of experience in poverty targeting or targeting social programs and developing registries or databases on poverty and vulnerability. He / She shall review the underlying methodology of the National Socio-economic Registry's (NSER) targeting framework, and provide suggestions on how it can be improved, particularly in transforming it into a dynamic registry and developing guidelines for its adoption by other programs.

B. National Consultants

8. **Social Protection and Conditional Cash Transfer Specialist** (4 person-months). The social protection and cash transfer specialist shall have a master's degree in Economics, Social Work, Public Administration, or other relevant discipline and more than 5 years of experience in designing, implementing, and/or evaluating social protection policies and programs. Prior experience working on social assistance with ADB or other development partner is an advantage. He/she will be responsible, in coordination with the international team leader, for developing a loan program suitable for ADB financing and shall: review the social protection policies and strategies of government and the BISP's implementation progress; work with the ADB project team, and coordinate the tasks of other consultants to guide overall project design and implementation arrangements; prepare technical reports and linked documents, and coordinate other due diligence for processing; and present findings of review and technical studies to various stakeholders.

9. **Financial Management and Risk Specialist** (4 person-months). The financial management and risk specialist shall have a bachelor's degree in accounting, audit or economics with at least 5 years of experience in finance, accounting and management, preferably in the public sector. He / She, in coordination with the international finance management and risk specialist, shall (i) conduct financial management assessment of the executing agency, in accordance with ADB guidelines; (iii) review risks and recommend measures to help safeguard risks; (iv) prepare financial and funds flow arrangements for the program; (vi) prepare financing plan and describe the flow of funds and disbursement procedures.

10. **Capacity Development Specialist** (3 person-months). The capacity development specialist shall have at least 10 years of experience in capacity building, training, and institutional development or other similar work, with a master's degree in human resource development and management, social work, public administration, education, or related field. He / She shall (i)

conduct institutional and capacity needs assessment and develop proposals to address gaps for the proposed project; (ii) evaluate the effectiveness of current organizational and institutional mechanisms supporting BISP; (iii) review organizational capacity for the CCT for primary education program; (iv) review organizational capacity for a CCT program for nutrition, and (iv) develop a set of interventions to improve systems and capacity of BISP.

11. **Training Facilitator** (3 person-months). The training facilitator shall have a bachelor's degree, preferably in education, social work, or management with at least 3 years of experience providing facilitator support or management support to capacity building activities. Excellent verbal and written communication skills in English are required. The facilitator will act as training secretariat, facilitate workshops, and discussions; document proceedings and prepare reports on TA activities. He / she shall assist the team leader and will work closely with the capacity development specialist and also coordinate with other specialists.

12. **Social Sector Economist** (4 person-months). The social sector economist shall have at least a master's degree in Economics or Statistics, and at least 8 years' experience of conducting economic analysis of social development projects. He / she will undertake an economic analysis of the proposed program following ADB's updated *Guidelines for the Economic Analysis of Projects* (March 2017). He / she shall review the performance of BISP, drawing on the available impact evaluations and research studies. He / she shall assist in developing project components and clearly define project outputs and activities and outcomes. He / she shall undertake a costing of the different components in coordination with the financial management specialists; prepare the economic analysis, sector assessment in line with ADB's requirements and a poverty and vulnerability assessment and social analysis for the Summary Poverty Reduction and Social Strategy (SPRSS), with inputs from other specialists.

13. **Social Development and Gender Specialist** (4 person-months). The social development and gender specialist will have a degree in gender, anthropology, international development, social development, sociology, or related fields with (post graduate for the international consultant) at least 5 years of relevant professional experience in social development, social protection, or gender and development. Familiarity with ADB policies on social safeguards and gender development is required. Working experience in social protection programs is highly preferred. The expert, in coordination with the international social development and gender specialist, shall be responsible for: (i) preparing and finalizing the poverty, social and gender assessments, reports and plans for the proposed program in accordance with ADB's Guidelines; conduct field surveys and focus group discussions to inform the assessments; provide inputs to the project team on social dimension and safeguard.

14. **Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist** (4 person-months). The monitoring and evaluation specialist shall have post graduate degree in economics or statistics, with 10 years working experience in monitoring and evaluation and undertaking impact evaluation studies and surveys using randomized control trials or semi-experimental methods. Familiarity with statistical analysis software programs is preferred for both. He / She, in coordination with the international monitoring and evaluation, shall be responsible for the following: (i) prepare options for improving the social registry and its interoperability with BISP targeting and ID system; (ii) develop and recommend a monitoring and evaluation framework for the project, including reporting templates; (iii) define project baseline in support of the M&E framework; (iv) review DLIs and define indicators, means of verification and timing with disbursements.